JERRY A. STERN, MEMBER

80th Legislative District

COMMITTEES:

Majority Chairman
Tourism & Recreational Development

State Government

HARRISBURG OFFICE: Room 315 Main Capitol Building PO Box 202080 Harrisburg, PA 17120-2080 Phone: (717) 787-9020 House of Representatives
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Harrisburg

July 11, 2013

DISTRICT OFFICES: 324 Allegheny Street Hollidaysburg, PA 16648 Phone: (814) 695-2398 Fax: (814) 946-7239

34 Cherry Avenue Tyrone, PA 16686 Phone: (814) 684-6092 Fax: (814) 684-7657

jstern@pahousegop.com www.JerryStern.com

The Honorable Kathleen Kane Attorney General of Pennsylvania 16th Floor, Strawberry Square Harrisburg, PA 17120

Dear Attorney General Kane:

We are troubled by your announcement, as the Commonwealth's Chief Law Enforcement Officer and an important part of the executive branch of government, that you have made the unilateral decision to refuse to defend a duly enacted Pennsylvania statutory law. We have no doubt that opponents of the law will cheer your decision. Nor do we doubt that supporters of the law will decry it. All of that is immaterial to the fundamental question, which is whether you will choose to ignore your constitutional and statutory obligation to defend Pennsylvania laws.

This question is not unique to our time. In an article in this week's Wall Street Journal, a former federal appellate judge noted that:

This matter—the limits of executive power—has deep historical roots. During the period of royal absolutism, English monarchs asserted a right to dispense with parliamentary statutes they disliked. King James II's use of the prerogative was a key grievance that lead to the Glorious Revolution of 1688. The very first provision of the English Bill of Rights of 1689—the most important precursor to the U.S. Constitution—declared that "the pretended power of suspending of laws, or the execution of laws, by regal authority, without consent of parliament, is illegal."

In Federalist No. 47, James Madison warned:

The accumulation of all powers, legislative, executive, and judiciary, in the same hands, whether of one, a few, or many, and whether hereditary, self-appointed, or elective, may justly be pronounced the very definition of tyranny.

Your announcement, and its implied arrogation of both executive AND legislative authority at the expense of the people, troubles us deeply. There are any number of Pennsylvania statutes with which we may personally disagree. Nevertheless, we do not ignore them to suit our political preference.

The Honorable Kathleen Kane July 11, 2013 Page 2

Pennsylvania's Constitution, at Article IV, § 4.1, specifically states that the Attorney General "shall exercise such powers and perform such duties as may be imposed by law."

Section 204 of the Commonwealth Attorneys Act clearly provides:

It shall be the duty of the Attorney General to uphold and defend the constitutionality of all statutes so as to prevent their suspension or abrogation in the absence of a controlling decision by a court of competent jurisdiction.

Quis custodiet ipsos custodes? Who shall watch the watchers themselves? When executive branch officials refuse to defend Commonwealth law despite the clear duties imposed by both the Pennsylvania Constitution and controlling statutes, the fundamental nature of the American experiment in representative democracy is called into question.

We would simply urge you to reconsider your decision to refuse to fulfill the duties of the office to which you were elected.

Sincerely,

Jerry A. Stein

Representative Jerry Stern 80th Legislative District

Representative Mike Turzai 28th Legislative District

Representative Paul Clymer 145th Legislative District

Dauld Olymer

Representative Jim Cox 129th Legislative District

Representative Sam Smith 66th Legislative District

Representative Sandy Major 111th Legislative District

Representative John McGinnis 79th Legislative District

Andor R Lles

Representative Gordon Denlinger 99th Legislative District

Matt Sable

Representative Matt Gabler 75th Legislative District

Representative Fred Keller 85th Legislative District

Tim Kueger
Representative Tim Krieger
57th Legislative District

T. Mark Mustio
Representative T. Mark Mustio
44th Legislative District

Representative Kathy Rapp 65th Legislative District

Representative Seth Grove 196th Legislative District

Representative RoseMarie Swanger

Representative RoseMarie Swanger 102nd Legislative District

Representative Todd Rock 90th Legislative District

cc: The Honorable Tom Corbett, Governor

Poli Kuuffmen

Representative Rob Kauffman 89th Legislative District

Representative Mark Keller 86th Legislative District

ave M. Walney

Representative David Maloney Legislative District

Representative Daryl Metcalfe Legislative District

Representative Becky Corbin 155th Legislative District

Representative Jerry Knowles 124th Legislative District

Knowles

Representative John Lawrence 13th Legislative District

Representative Dan Truitt 156th Legislative District